

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ARTICULATION LEARNING STRATEGY IN IMPROVING STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES IN FIKIH CLASS X-G AT MADRASAH ALIYAH MIFTAHUL ULUM BETTET PAMEKASAN

Siti Noer Haliza¹; Moh Subhan,² Syamsul Rijal³, Ummu Kulsum⁴

^{1,2,3,4}Universitas Islam Madura, Indonesia

¹Corresponding E-mail: sitinoerhaliza25@gmail.com

Abstract

This study aims to describe the implementation of the articulation learning strategy in improving the Fikih learning outcomes of Grade X-G students at Madrasah Aliyah Miftahul Ulum Bettet Pamekasan, as well as to identify the supporting and inhibiting factors. The background of the problem is the low active participation of students due to the dominance of the lecture method in Fikih learning. The research employs a qualitative approach using a case study design. Data were collected through participant observation, semi-structured interviews with teachers, students, and the school principal, as well as document study. Data analysis was carried out using the interactive model of Miles and Huberman, while data validity was checked through source and technique triangulation. The findings show that the implementation of the articulation strategy took place through four stages: planning, material delivery, sequential re-delivery, and reporting and reinforcement. This strategy has been proven to improve learning outcomes, as evidenced by students' increased confidence in orally re-explaining Fikih concepts in front of the class, their active involvement in group discussions to reconstruct understanding, and their ability to re-deliver material in their own words in a coherent and logical manner. Supporting factors for implementation include the teacher's readiness in managing classroom dynamics and the creation of a conducive learning atmosphere, while inhibiting factors include limited lesson time allocation and the diversity of students' initial ability levels that require different forms of individual guidance.

Keywords: Articulation Learning Strategy; Student Learning Outcomes; Fikih; Qualitative Research; Madrasah Aliyah

A. Introduction

Fikih is one of the core subjects of Islamic religious education in madrasah, playing a role in shaping students' understanding of sharia law and their ability to apply it in daily life (Mansir 2021). Fikih materials contain many procedural concepts and memorization of procedures for worship and muamalah that demand deep understanding, not merely textual memorization (Mansir and Purnomo 2020). In reality, Fikih learning in many madrasahs is still dominated by one-way lecture methods, causing students to be passive, less actively engaged, and achieving suboptimal learning outcomes (Kamali and Sugiyanto 2024). A similar condition was also observed among Grade X-G students at Madrasah Aliyah Miftahul Ulum Bettet Pamekasan, who demonstrated low active participation during Fikih learning and learning outcomes that had not fully met the expected targets.

Various studies have shown that contextual and participatory approaches can enhance students' critical thinking and understanding of Fikih materials (Farizi,

Ardiansyah, and Amran 2025), while method variations such as discussion have also been proven effective in improving student learning outcomes in this subject (Sarumaha et al. 2022). However, the application of cooperative learning strategies that specifically encourage students to actively re-explain material to their peers remains rarely explored in depth in the context of Fikih learning at madrasah aliyah (Purba et al. 2022). One strategy considered relevant to address this issue is the articulation learning strategy – a cooperative learning model (Sianipar 2024), which assigns students in pairs to alternately re-deliver material they have just received from the teacher in a chain manner, so that all students are required to actively listen, understand, and re-communicate the information obtained (Sitanggang, Napitupulu, and Simamora 2023).

The effectiveness of the articulation strategy in improving learning outcomes has been demonstrated by a number of studies across various subjects and educational levels, both at the primary and secondary school levels (Muróbbi 2024). These findings consistently indicate that the articulation strategy promotes active student engagement, thus positively impacting learning outcomes. Theoretically, the articulation strategy can be regarded as a variant of cooperative learning that emphasizes positive interdependence among group members and individual accountability. Unlike large-group cooperative models such as STAD or Jigsaw, articulation forms small pairs so that each student has more speaking opportunities while also facing higher accountability pressure to fully understand the material before re-delivering it to their partner.

Although evidence of the effectiveness of the articulation strategy is abundant, most previous studies have used quantitative approaches or classroom action research focused on measuring learning outcome scores, while the contextual implementation process in the field – particularly for Fikih learning at madrasah aliyah – has not been extensively explored qualitatively (Novitasari 2021). This gap forms the basis for the importance of this research, which aims to: (1) describe how the articulation learning strategy is implemented by teachers in Fikih class X-G at Madrasah Aliyah Miftahul Ulum Bettet Pamekasan; (2) describe the impact of that implementation on student learning outcomes; and (3) identify the supporting and inhibiting factors that emerge during the implementation process.

The problem of low student active participation in Fikih learning cannot be separated from the context of the current curriculum policy. The implementation of the Merdeka Curriculum demands a shift in learning orientation from teacher-centered to student-centered, including in Fikih subjects that have long been associated with memorization and lecture methods (Malau, Napitupulu, and Simatupang 2025). This demand makes the selection of appropriate learning strategies an increasingly urgent issue to examine, given that the success of curriculum implementation greatly depends on the ability of teachers to translate the principles of active learning into everyday classroom practice (Nurjannah and dkk 2020). This research is expected to contribute both theoretically and practically – enriching the study of articulation strategy implementation in Fikih learning at madrasah aliyah, and serving as a reference for teachers and educational practitioners in designing varied cooperative learning strategies.

B. Method

This research employs a qualitative approach using case study research design, chosen because the research objective is to gain a deep understanding of the implementation process of the articulation learning strategy in the natural context of Fikih learning in a specific class (Anshori, Setiaji, and Anita 2023). This approach allows researchers to explore the meanings, interactions, and social dynamics that occur during the learning process aspects that cannot be adequately captured through quantitative approaches.

The research was conducted at Madrasah Aliyah Miftahul Ulum Bettet Pamekasan during the even semester of the 2024/2025 academic year. Research participants were selected using purposive sampling, consisting of one Fikih teacher for Grade X-G, ten Grade X-G students selected based on variations in learning achievement levels (high, medium, low), as well as the school principal and the vice principal for curriculum affairs as supporting informants to obtain contextual data on learning policies at the madrasah.

Data were collected through three techniques. First, participant observation was conducted over four Fikih learning sessions, with the researcher acting as an observer systematically recording each stage of the articulation strategy implementation using a structured observation sheet containing indicators such as teacher activity in delivering material, student activity when re-delivering material in a chain manner, and the dynamics of student interactions within groups; field notes were also made to record spontaneous events not captured in the observation sheet.

Second, semi-structured interviews were conducted in depth for 30–45 minutes per participant, using an interview guide developed based on articulation strategy indicators and supporting/inhibiting factors; teacher interviews focused on experiences and constraints during implementation, student interviews explored their perceptions and involvement, while interviews with the principal and vice principal for curriculum aimed to obtain policy data and institutional support; all interviews were recorded with participants' consent and transcribed verbatim. Third, document study was conducted by analyzing Lesson Plans (RPP) to assess alignment between planning and classroom implementation, grade lists to observe learning outcome development, and photo and video documentation of learning activities as supporting data. Data were analyzed using Miles and Huberman's interactive model, conducted cyclically and repeatedly until data saturation was reached

The data reduction stage was carried out by summarizing, selecting key points, and organizing data into thematic categories such as implementation stages, participation improvement, supporting factors, and inhibiting factors; this process produced initial codes that were subsequently grouped into major themes. The data presentation stage was conducted in narrative and matrix form to facilitate conclusion drawing, while the verification stage was conducted by comparing findings across data sources. Data validity was checked through source and technique triangulation (Rahim 2022), (Putri 2022), supplemented by member checking to ensure that the researcher's interpretations aligned with participants' intentions (Nur, 2022).

As an example of triangulation application, data on student participation improvement did not rely on a single source but were compared across classroom observation results that recorded an increase in the number of students actively asking questions and re-delivering material, interview results with students who reported feeling more confident speaking in front of the class, and teacher statements observing changes in student attitudes from session to session; these three data sources were then synthesized to reach valid conclusions. Prior to data collection, the researcher obtained consent from the school principal, teachers, and students as part of research ethics implementation, with student identity confidentiality maintained through the use of participant codes (e.g., S1, S2, S3) in the reporting of results.

The following are the stages of articulation strategy implementation that served as the focus of observation in this study:

Table 1. Stages of Implementation of the Articulation Learning Strategy

No.	Stage	Activity Description	Time
1.	Planning	The teacher prepares lesson plans (RPP) based on the articulation strategy, compiles Fikih materials, forms student pairs, and prepares observation sheets.	15 minutes
2.	Material Delivery	The teacher briefly explains the main points of the Fikih material using varied lecture methods and Q&A.	20 minutes
3.	Paired Articulation	Students take turns explaining the material to their partner. The partner listens and provides corrections or additions.	30 minutes
4.	Class Discussion	The teacher facilitates brief presentations from several pairs and provides confirmation and reinforcement of student answers.	20 minutes
5.	Evaluation	The teacher administers a brief oral/written assessment to measure students' understanding of the articulated material.	C inutes

C. Finding and Discussion

1. Finding

The implementation of the articulation learning strategy in Fikih class X-G proceeded through four stages. First, the planning stage, in which the teacher prepared material by considering a structure that could be broken into sequential parts, and prepared worksheets as tools to help students summarize information. Second, the material delivery stage, in which the teacher briefly explained the basic Fikih concepts in front of the class before students were divided into pairs. Third, the sequential re-delivery stage, in which one

student in each pair re-explained the recently received material to their partner, then roles were swapped, so that all students actively participated both as deliverers and receivers of information. Fourth, the reporting and reinforcement stage, in which several pairs were asked to present summaries of their discussion results in front of the class, after which the teacher provided conceptual clarification and reinforcement, and administered a brief formative test to measure students' understanding.

The worksheets prepared by the teacher during the planning stage functioned as visual aids that helped students organize information before re-delivering it to their partner, particularly for students who still struggled to spontaneously formulate verbal explanations. During the re-delivery stage, the role swap between information deliverer and receiver allowed each student to experience two different yet complementary cognitive processes: understanding the received information and reorganizing it so it could be clearly communicated to their partner.

The implementation of this strategy had an impact on three aspects of student learning outcomes. In the cognitive aspect, students demonstrated improved understanding of Fikih concepts, as evidenced by their ability to re-explain material more coherently and by better formative test results compared to before the strategy was applied. In the affective aspect, students showed increased confidence, enthusiasm, and active involvement throughout the learning process. In the psychomotor aspect, students demonstrated improved oral communication skills and teamwork in completing paired tasks.

Several factors were identified as supporting the successful implementation of this strategy, including the teacher's readiness and creativity in managing group formation and selecting material suitable for chain teaching, a conducive and interaction-friendly classroom atmosphere, and students' relatively high learning motivation in the Fikih subject. Conversely, inhibiting factors included limited lesson time allocation, causing the re-delivery stage to sometimes feel rushed; the diversity of academic abilities among students, leading to some pairs being unbalanced in material mastery; and some students who tended to be reserved and lacked confidence when required to re-explain material to their partner, necessitating additional encouragement from the teacher or their partner.

2. Discussion

These findings align with a number of previous studies that quantitatively proved the articulation strategy to be effective in improving learning outcomes across various subjects, such as thematic learning at the primary school level (Kosasih et al. 2024), Social Studies (Listrianti, Hidayah, and Lama 2025), religious education (Fahimuddin 2025), biology (Fauziah 2024), and Natural Sciences (Kurniawati 2021). Unlike those studies that generally measured improvements in learning outcome scores quantitatively, this research provides a process-level explanation of the mechanism behind such improvements namely through peer interaction that compels students to actively process and re-communicate information in line with the principles of active learning that emphasize student engagement as the center of the learning process (Mantazli 2022), (Budiyati 2023). Findings regarding increased critical thinking and student participation also reinforce previous studies on the importance of contextual and participatory approaches in Fikih learning (Dewi 2024).

Upon closer examination, improvements in conceptual understanding on the cognitive aspect align with the principles of Bloom's taxonomy, in which the ability to re-explain a concept to others operates at a higher cognitive level than merely recalling or passively understanding. The sequential re-delivery process essentially compels students to move from the remembering level to the understanding level and even to the applying level. This mechanism differs from Problem Based Learning, which was found effective in improving critical thinking skills in Fikih learning (Listrianti et al. 2025), articulation places greater emphasis on reinforcing understanding through social rehearsal, while PBL emphasizes reinforcement through real case analysis.

The increase in student confidence and enthusiasm on the affective aspect can be explained through Bandura's concept of self-efficacy, which states that a person's belief in their ability to complete a task can increase through repeated successful experiences. Each time a student successfully re-delivers material to their partner, that experience serves as a source of self-efficacy reinforcement that motivates the student to speak more boldly and become increasingly engaged in subsequent opportunities. This finding reinforces the results of (Nur 2022) who reported increased student learning activity following the application of the articulation model, while also providing a mechanistic explanation for why such increased activity occurs.

In the psychomotor aspect, the improvement in oral communication skills and student cooperation is relevant to examine through the perspective of social constructivism, which emphasizes that meaningful learning occurs through social interaction with others who are at a relatively comparable level of understanding—not merely through knowledge transmission from the teacher. Vygotsky's concept of the zone of proximal development is relevant for explaining this phenomenon, whereby students can help each other expand their understanding through dialogue and meaning negotiation with their partner, a process that would not occur optimally if learning only proceeded unidirectionally from teacher to student.

The inhibiting factor of diversity in students' academic abilities aligns with the common challenges in implementing pair-based cooperative learning, as also identified in the application of the true or false strategy in Fikih subjects. This challenge indicates the need for a more careful grouping strategy, for example by considering the mapping of students' initial abilities before pairs are formed. Likewise, limited lesson time allocation reflects a broader structural challenge in Fikih learning at madrasah, given that the material to be covered according to the curriculum is often disproportionate to the available lesson time allocation (Bawazier and Yuliastutik 2024).

In practical terms, these findings have important implications for the development of pedagogical competence among Fikih teachers at madrasah aliyah. Teachers are not only required to have a deep understanding of subject matter, but also need the ability to design material divisions suitable for chain delivery, manage paired group dynamics, and provide appropriate reinforcement at the reporting stage. These implications align with the importance of teacher creativity in designing interactive learning models to improve the quality of Islamic religious education in general (Abbas, Ali, and Ahmad 2024)

Theoretically, this research expands the understanding of the mechanisms underlying the effectiveness of the articulation strategy, which has so far been more widely revealed through quantitative approaches in general subjects. By presenting qualitative data that explains the processes, interactions, and subjective experiences of participants, this research complements the picture that has previously tended to present only learning outcome scores as evidence of effectiveness, without explaining in detail how and why such improvements occur in the context of religious learning with its distinctive normative-procedural characteristics.

The finding regarding improved student understanding after re-explaining material to their partner also aligns with the phenomenon known as the protégé effect or learning by teaching the tendency for a person to understand material more deeply when prepared to teach it to others. The obligation to re-explain material drives students to engage in more intensive cognitive elaboration compared to when they only act as listeners

E. Conclusion

Based on the research results and discussion described above, it can be concluded that the implementation of the articulation learning strategy in Fikih class X-G at Madrasah Aliyah Miftahul Ulum Bettet Pamekasan proceeded through four stages: material explanation by the teacher, formation of paired groups, sequential re-delivery of information among students, and reporting of results in front of the class. This strategy has been proven to improve understanding of Fikih concepts, students' active participation, and student cooperation during the learning process. The success of the implementation was supported by the teacher's readiness in managing classroom dynamics and the creation of a conducive learning atmosphere, although it was still hindered by limited lesson time allocation and the diversity of students' initial ability levels requiring different forms of guidance.

These findings affirm the importance of applying varied and consistent cooperative strategies to optimize Fikih learning outcomes at madrasah. In practical terms, this research provides a concrete example of articulation strategy application that can be adapted to the characteristics of the material and student conditions, and serves as a reflective resource for teachers to move away from the dominance of the lecture method toward a more student-centered approach as demanded by the Merdeka Curriculum.

Nevertheless, this research has limitations as it was only conducted in one class at one madrasah, making its findings contextual and not broadly generalizable; the relatively short observation period was also unable to capture the long-term impact of the articulation strategy on understanding retention and consistency of student activity. Based on these limitations, several recommendations are proposed. For Fikih teachers at other madrasah aliyah wishing to implement this strategy, it is recommended to first map students' abilities when forming pairs to ensure appropriate matching of comprehension levels, as well as to arrange a more flexible time allocation that accounts for the complexity of the material and number of students.

For future researchers, it is recommended to examine the application of the articulation strategy in other Fikih materials with different characteristics, such as practical

worship material or muamalah, as well as to compare its effectiveness with other cooperative strategies for example, think-pair-share or jigsaw –in the context of religious learning at madrasah using more diverse research designs, such as comparative studies or quasi-experiments, in order to obtain more comprehensive and generalizable findings. Overall, this article warrants consideration for publication after revision in several aspects: consistency of implementation stages (with uniform stage naming throughout the article), strengthening novelty (by affirming the research's position among previous studies), methodological refinement (with operational descriptions as recommended), and discussion simplification (by focusing on key findings without expanding to irrelevant aspects). With these improvements, this article is expected to make a stronger and more measurable contribution to the study of active learning strategies in Islamic Religious Education, particularly in Fikih at madrasah aliyah.

F. Acknowledgment

The authors extend their gratitude to the school principal, Fikih teachers, and all Grade X-G students of Madrasah Aliyah Miftahul Ulum Bettet Pamekasan who granted permission and actively participated throughout the research process. The authors also thank all parties who provided moral and technical support until this article was completed. This research received no specific funding from any institution.

G. Bibliography

- Abbas, M. A., H. Ali, and S. Ahmad. 2024. "Penerapan Model Dan Metode Pembelajaran Interaktif Untuk Meningkatkan Kualitas Pendidikan Agama Islam Di Sekolah." *Edukatif: Jurnal Edukasi*.
- Anshori, I., H. Setiaji, and S. Anita. 2023. "Penggunaan Metode Pembelajaran Inovatif Melalui Strategi Example Non Example Terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa Pada Mata Pelajaran Fiqh." *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Al-Ilmi* 6.
- Bawazier, M. Taufiq, and Yuliastutik. 2024. "Implementasi Model Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning Dalam Meningkatkan Motivasi Belajar Siswa Pada Mata Pelajaran PAI Di SMA Islam Perlaungan Waru Sidoarjo." *Jurnal Budi Pekerti Agama Islam* 2(1).
- Budiyati, Sri. 2023. *Strategi Pembelajaran: Konsep Dan Ragamnya*. Kediri: CV. Win Media.
- Dewi, Deby Kurnia. 2024. *Strategi Pembelajaran*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Baru Press.
- Fahimuddin. 2025. "Implementasi Model Problem Based Learning (PBL) Dalam Meningkatkan Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Siswa Pada Mata Pelajaran PAI Di SMAN 4 Kota Bima." *FIKRUNA: Jurnal Ilmiah Kependidikan Dan Kemasyarakatan* 7(4).
- Farizi, Muhammad Farhan, Andri Ardiansyah, and Amran. 2025. "Strategi Guru Dalam Meningkatkan Kualitas Pembelajaran Fikih Di Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Kota Bogor." *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Dakwah* 5(3):259.
- Fauziah, R. 2024. "Strategi Pembelajaran Berbasis Masalah Bab Fikih Pada Mata Pelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Di SMA Rabiah Adawiyah." *Journal of Islamic Education Studies* 3(1). doi: 10.58569/jies.v3i1.1041.
- Kamali, Ahmad Nur, and Sugiyanto. 2024. "Strategi Guru Mata Pelajaran Fiqh Dalam

- Peningkatan Pemahaman Agama." *Ngaos: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran* 2(2):105. doi: 10.59373/ngaos.v2i2.63.
- Kosasih, F., I. Khadijah, B. Komara, E. Kusman, Y. Rodini, A. M. S. Islam, A. T. Permadi, and A. T. Komala. 2024. "Manajemen Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning (PBL) Terhadap Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis Siswa Kelas 8 Dalam Mata Pelajaran Fikih Materi Sedekah, Hibah, Dan Hadiah." *Innovative: Journal of Social Science Research* 4(4):10393-406.
- Kurniawati, N. 2021. "Upaya Guru Mata Pelajaran Fiqih Dalam Pengembangan Spiritual Siswa Kelas VII D MTs Hidayatul Mubtadiin Jati Agung Lampung Selatan Tahun Pelajaran 2020/2021." *Ar Royhan: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 1(2):50-65.
- Listrianti, F., T. Hidayah, and A. V Lama. 2025. "Enhancing Contextual Understanding and Critical Thinking in Fiqh Learning through Problem-Based Learning." *Journal of Islamic Education Research* 6(1):111-24.
- Malau, Melani Octaviani, Tianggur Medi Napitupulu, and Ronny Simatupang. 2025. "Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Artikulasi Terhadap Hasil Belajar Pendidikan Agama Kristen Dan Budi Pekerti Peserta Didik Kelas XI SMA Negeri 1 Pahae Julu Kabupaten Tapanuli Utara Tahun Pembelajaran 2025/2026." *Jurnal Pendidikan Sosial Dan Humaniora*.
- Mansir, Firman. 2021. "Analisis Model-Model Pembelajaran Fikih Yang Aktual Dalam Merespons Isu Sosial Di Sekolah Dan Madrasah." *Ta'dibuna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 10(1):88-99. doi: 10.32832/tadibuna.v10i1.4212.
- Mansir, Firman, and Halim Purnomo. 2020. "Urgensi Pembelajaran Fiqih Dalam Meningkatkan Religiusitas Siswa Madrasah." *AL-WIJDÂN Journal of Islamic Education Studies* 5(2):167-79. doi: 10.58788/alwijdn.v5i2.538.
- Mantazli. 2022. "Strategi Pembelajaran Fiqih Di Madrasah." *Journal of Innovative and Creativity (JOECY)*.
- Muróbbî, Tim Redaksi. 2024. "Transformasi Pembelajaran Fikih Melalui Kurikulum Merdeka Belajar." *Muróbbî: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*.
- Novitasari, M. 2021. "Penerapan Strategi Pembelajaran Active Learning Dengan Metode True or False Dan Quiz Team Untuk Meningkatkan Pemahaman Mata Pelajaran Aqidah Akhlak Siswa Kelas VII MTs NU Matholibul Huda Kudus." IAIN KUDUS.
- Nur, F. 2022. "Peningkatan Pemahaman Mata Pelajaran Fikih Materi Puasa Melalui Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif." *ALFIHRIS: Jurnal Inspirasi Pendidikan* 1(1).
- Nurjannah, and dkk. 2020. "Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Artikulasi Terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa Kelas XI Di MA Patra Mandiri Palembang." *Jurnal Neraca* 2:210-19.
- Purba, Yanti Elnida, Reflina Sinaga, Juli Ana, and Darinda Sofia Tanjung. 2022. "Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Artikulasi Dalam Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Di Kelas V SD Negeri 060935 Medan Johor Tahun Pembelajaran 2021/2022." *Primary: Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar* 11(5):1420-29. doi: 10.33578/jpkip.v11i5.9082.
- Putri, S. 2022. "Upaya Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa Pada Materi Fiqih Dengan Model True or False Kelas V Di MIN 6 Magetan Tahun Ajaran 2021/2022." IAIN Ponorogo.
- Rahim, A. 2022. "Penerapan Strategi True or False Mata Pelajaran Fiqih Untuk

Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa Kelas VI." *Prosiding Pendidikan Profesi Guru Agama Islam (PPGAI)* 2(1):1888–1901.

Sarumaha, Murnihati, Darmawan Harefa, Yan Piter Basman Ziraluo, Amaano Fau, Yohanna Theresia Venty Fau, Adam Smith Bago, Tatema Telambanua, Fatolosa Hulu, Kaminudin Telaumbanua, Indah Permata Sari Lase, Baziduhu Laia, Lies Dian Marsa Ndraha, and Andrian Novialdi. 2022. "Penggunaan Model Pembelajaran Artikulasi Terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa Pada Mata Pelajaran IPA Terpadu." *Aksara: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Nonformal* 8(3):2045–52.

Sianipar, dkk. 2024. "Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Artikulasi Terhadap Keaktifan Belajar PAK Siswa Kelas VIII SMP Negeri 3 Tarutung Tahun Pembelajaran 2023/2024." *Jurnal Pendidikan Berkarakter* 2(1).

Sitanggang, Basar, Tianggur Medi Napitupulu, and Dame Taruli Simamora. 2023. "Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Artikulasi Terhadap Keaktifan Belajar PAK Siswa Kelas X SMK Yayasan Saposurung Balige Kabupaten Toba Tahun Pembelajaran 2023/2024." *Jurnal Riset Rumpun Agama Dan Filsafat* 2(2).